

Record of discussions of the meeting of the International Advisory Panel (IAP) for NRHM held on 7.8.2007 under the Chairmanship of Union Minister for Health & FW.

The Annual International Advisory Panel meeting for NRHM was held on 7.8.2007 under the Chairmanship of the Hon'ble HFM. List of those who participated is at Annex-I.

2. At the outset, the Hon'ble HFM welcomed the International Panelists to this meeting. He expressed his gratitude to Prof. Jeffry Sachs and all the members of the team for having taken the time to look at the National Rural Health Mission. HFM mentioned that the NRHM is perhaps the largest public health programme anywhere in the world and that early results from its two years' of implementation are extremely encouraging and positive. He mentioned the importance of getting international advise on the work that is being done from time to time in order that NRHM achieves the ambitious goals and objectives that it has set out for itself. HFM requested the Secretary (H&FW) to make a detailed presentation on where we are under the NRHM. A copy of the presentation made by the Secretary (HFW) is at Annex-II.

3. After the presentation HFM requested Dr. Jeffrey Sachs for his opening remarks. Prof. Jeffrey Sachs complimented the Minister for taking up the NRHM which is indeed the largest public health programme in the world. He shared some of the discussions that he had the previous day with experts like Dr. Abhay Bang, Dr. Srinath Reddy and Dr. Rajinikant Arole. While commending the design of NRHM, Prof. Sachs said that it was a remarkable achievement for the country to focus so clearly on quantitative goals. It was important to get everybody on board and he welcomed the openness of the Ministry in doing so. He welcomed the focus on neo-natal mortality, the efforts on saving mothers and emphasized the need for making institutional deliveries meaningful by improving the quality of care. While commending on the Pulse Polio Eradication Efforts, Prof. Sachs emphasized the need for its integration with routine immunization so that a

campaign for routine immunization could be built on the mass mobilization for Polio. Prof. Sachs emphasized the need for simultaneous action on issues of vector control, mental health and non-communicable diseases, etc. He thought that having Accredited Social Health Activists (ASHA) was a very good idea and more efforts should go into making a team at the village level using quality training material and training personnel. Prof. Sachs suggested the possibility of blended payments for ASHAs which could include a fixed honorarium plus a performance based payment. He emphasized important areas like e-solution to problems of health system and the need for focused attention on selected district. He also mentioned about other health policy issues like Health Insurance and Public Private Partnership but maintained that for poor, there was no substitute to a well functioning public system. The need for independent evaluation and assessments was also highlighted. Prof. Sachs then briefly mentioned about the emerging issues in the context of climate change and how global warming would impact on profile and distribution of diseases.

4. **Dr. Larry Brilliant** endorsed the views of Prof. Sachs and added that due to climate change different types of new diseases are appearing which require extra efforts through research to control them.

5. **Mr. Rajat Gupta** emphasized the need for Public Private Partnerships within the overarching framework of NRHM as neither the government nor the private sector alone can provide quality health care for all. He gave the example of EMRI and the partnership with Satyam Computers in Andhra Pradesh to provide an ambulance system. The issues of standard and quality and health as human rights were highlighted by Mr. Gupta emphasizing the need for consequences of non-performance. He also emphasized on a very focused attention on a few public health problems like Malaria.

6. **Dr. Jaime Sepulveda** emphasized that it was not more money for health but more health for money which is equally important. He mentioned about the

need for money, manpower and institutions that could retain trained people. The need for putting the polio energy into the routine immunization was also emphasized and the example of Latin American countries having National Immunisation Days was referred to. Subjects like Health Insurance for the Poor and harnessing the private sector for public health goals was also mentioned.

7. **Dr. Stephen R. Leeder** emphasized the role of Government in protection of the poor. Considering that there are three million Cardiovascular deaths in India and of these one million are in the middle age group, there was a need to focus through research on some of these aspects as well.

8. **Dr. Walter Willet** emphasized the importance of diet and life style related problems and how it could make a difference in fighting cardiovascular diseases, diabetes, etc. He mentioned about the importance of the fight against tobacco and the need for low cost and simple protocols that help people lead healthier lives.

9. **Dr. Roger** Glass emphasized the need for strengthening of disease surveillance in order that outcomes are measured. The need for evidence based voice on policies of public health will help in countering a lot of propaganda.

10. **Dr. Kiyoshi Kurokawa** emphasized the importance of clean water and electricity for all health issues. He offered support for solar powered products and water purification systems from Japan.

11. **Dr. Rachel Moresky** emphasized the importance of emergency physician and systems of care at the facility, nurse practitioner and non communicable diseases focus.

12. **Dr. Vikram Patel** mentioned about the need for disease priorities for different districts. According to him, it is important to focus on problems like

Mental Health and Understand why different States perform differently. He also mentioned that local Medical Practitioners in India can be a huge resource and their services can be utilized for public health under the NRHM.

13. **Dr. Maha El-Adawy** highlighted the issues with regard to water and sanitation and need to attend to non-communicable diseases as well.

14 **Dr. Ashok Alexander** highlighted importance of advocacy and media strategies.

15 **Dr. Joanna Rubinstein** highlighted the importance of participation of NGOs. She also emphasized that tropical diseases should not be neglected.

At the end, HFM responded to the useful suggestions made by the members of the International Panel and said that he would very much like to incorporate their suggestions and idea into the NRHM. In conclusion Dr. Sachs mentioned the importance that the Hon'ble Prime Minister gives to the NRHM. He suggested that a couple of model districts could be taken up in each State and monitored effectively. Prof. Sachs emphasized the need for simultaneously moving forward on a range of issues and the importance of credible external assessments of the programme.

Annexure-I

**Meeting of the International Advisory Panel for NRHM held on 7.8.07 under the
Chairpersonship of Hon'ble Union Minister for Health & Family Welfare**

<u>S.No</u>	<u>Name & Designation</u>	<u>Address</u>	<u>e-mail address</u>	
1.	Prof. Jeffery Sachs Director, Earth Institute Special Advisor to UN Sec Gen	314, Low Library Columbia University New York, NY 10027	sachs@columbia.edn	1-212-854-9482
2.	Mr Vikram Patael Professor of International Mental Health	London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine, Sangam, Goa India	vikram.patel@lshtm.ac. uk	
3.	Dr Maha El-Adawy Policy Advisor for Health BDP, UNDP	336, East 45 th St. Uganda House, 2 nd floor, New York, USA-10017	maha.eladawy@undp.o rg	
4.	Mr Ashok Alexander Country Director India Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation	A-10, Sanskrit Bhavan, Aruna Asaf Ali Marg New Delhi 110 067	ashok.alexander@india .gatefoundation.org	
5.	Ms Sonia Ehrlich Sachs Health Coordinator Millennium Villages Project Earth Institute	Columbia University, New York, USA	SSACHS@ei.columbia. edu	
6.	Mr Joanna Rubinstein Director for Center on Global Health and Economic Development at the Earth Institute, Columbia University	Columbia University, New York, USA	jrubinstein@ei.columbi a.edu	
7.	Mr Stephen R Leeder, MD Professor of Public Health & Community Medicine Director, _____ Health Policy Institute	Victor Coppleson Building University of Sydney MSW 2006 Australia	steve@med.usyd.edu.a n	+61293515211 +61293515204 (F)
8.	Mr Roger Glass Director, Fogarty International Center, NIH	Bldg 31, RMBZCOZ 31 Center Drive (MSC 2220) Bethesdd, MD 20892-2220	GLASSR2MAIL.NIH.G OV	1-301-496-1415 301-402-2173(F)
9.	Mr Jaime Sepulveda Director, Global Health Strategies Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation	617, East Lakeside Avenue Seattle, WA 98102 P O Box 23360	jaime.sepuereda@gate sfoundation.org	1-206-770-1658 1-206-709-

				3170
10	Mr Larry Brilliant, MD Executive Director Google Foundation and Google.org	8, Ralston Avenue Mill Valley, Calif USA 94941	Brilliant@Google.com LarryBrilliant@gmail.com	1 6507668529
11	Mr Rajat K Gupta Senior Partner Mikinsey & Co	Mckinsey & Co 3 Landmark Plaza Stanford CT, USA	rajat_gupta@mckinsey.com	+81-90-3068-5814
12	Shri Kiyoshi Kurokava, MD	Science Advisor to the Prime Minister, Japan	kurokawa@is.icc.u-lokai.ac.jp	
13	Prof. Rachel Moresky MD, MPH,FACEP	Columbia University, Director of International Emergency Medicine and Faculty Mailman School Public Health	rtm2102@columbia.edu	
14	Mr Walter Willet, MD,MPH,DPH	Department of Nutrition Harvard School of Public Health	wwillett@hsph.harward.edu	617-432-4111
15	Prof Nirupam Bajpai	The Earth Institute at Columbia University, New York	nirupam.bajpai@columbia.edu	212-203 3969
16	Smt. Anita Das, Secretary (Ayush)			
17	Shri Naresh Dayal, Secretary (Health & Family Welfare)			
18	Dr Rakesh Srivastava, DGHS			
19	Ms Sujatha Rao, AS & DG(NACO)			
20	Shri Deepak Gupta, Additional Secretary (DG)			
21	Shri G.C.Chaturvedi, Joint Secretary and Mission Director(NRHM)			
22	Shri Raghubir Singh, AS & FA			
23	Shri Pravir Krishna, Joint Secretary(PK)			
24	Shri Bhavani Thyagrajan,			

	Joint Secretary(BT)			
25	Shri K Ramamoorthy, Joint Secretary (KR)			
26	Ms Aradhana Johri, Joint Secretary (AJ)			
27	Shri Vineet Chawdhary, Joint Secretary (VC)			
28	Shri Amarjeet Sinha, Joint Secretary (AS)			
29	Shri B K Prasad, Joint Secretary (BKP)			
30	Shri K. Dhanavel, PS to HFM			
31	Shri Padmanabhan, Addl. PS to HFM			
32	Shri Sitaraman, PA to HFM			
33	Ms Astha Khatwani, Director (IFD)			
34	Shri Tarun Seem, Director (NRHM)			
35	Ms Archana Varma, DS(NRHM-I)			
36	Dr T. Sundaraman, Exective Director, NHSRC			
37	Dr N.K.Ganguly, DG, ICMR			